Leveraging Competency-Based Education Models to Promote Equity and Student Success: The Role of the SHEEO

SHEEO Higher Education Policy Conference
August 7, 2019
Session Overview

- Definition and rationale for competency-based education using equity lens
- Federal landscape
- Role of the SHEEO in promoting institutional innovation
  - Ohio Department of Higher Education
  - Illinois Board of Higher Education
- Resources
COMPETENCY-BASED EDUCATION NETWORK

www.CBEnetwork.org
WHAT IS CBE?
Focus on what’s needed to be successful - outcomes.

Understands the theory of XXX, and has the skills and dispositions to successfully apply all of these at the beginning level in XXX situation.

What do I need to know? What theories or ideas?

What do I need to be able to do?

What dispositions must I display?

Where must I be able to apply these KSAs, and at what level?
What is CBE?

- **Formal learning** opportunities designed by **postsecondary institutions** that lead to recognized educational **credentials**, created by **backward design** from a disciplinary perspective on what a credential-holder should **know** and be **able to do**, with a demonstration of **mastery** required through **performance on authentic assessments**.

- These programs can be referred to as “**direct assessment programs**” or “**non-direct assessment CBE programs**”. 
Wide Range of Models Nationally

CBE Framework Continuum

Course-based, integrates discrete competencies into a single course

No courses, no credit hours, know competencies, earn credential

Learning measured by seat time and teacher-created assessments

Learning measured by direct assessment; standardized, consistent tools
CBL Relationship To CBE

### Competency-Based Learning
- Courses or modules offered by IHEs
- Prior Learning Assessment
- Military credit
- Other work-based learning
- Apprenticeships and returnships
- Industry certifications
- Government licensures

### Competency-Based Education
- Direct assessment programs
- Non-direct assessment CBE programs
Who’s Engaged? Diverse Solutions
Who’s Engaged? Diverse Solutions
CURRENT STATE OF THE FIELD
National Survey

- Track the development of the field and understand motivation, implementation, and barriers or facilitators

- Builds on Eduventures’ 2016 Survey, *Deconstructing CBE*
Survey Respondents

501 institutions, representing all sectors and both 2- and 4-year institutions
Institutions primarily view CBE as a way to serve nontraditional students and respond to workforce needs...

...with improving learning outcomes and engaging in education innovation close behind.
On The Path to CBE

Of institutions who said “adopted/in progress”

57% reported being in the currently in the planning stage

43% reported course- or program-level adoption
Perceived barriers to CBE implementation represent both internal and external factors:

1. Federal Student Aid regulations and processes
2. Institution’s business systems and processes
3. Other priority initiatives

The difference between those adopting versus those just “interested” is on-campus expertise for developing CBE programs.
Most institutions are optimistic about the future of CBE: **75%** of institutions expect CBE will grow in the next five years... regardless of whether they’ve adopted CBE themselves... ...and regardless of institution type.
430 institutions are in the process of adopting or interested in adopting CBE.

- 51% are at the planning stage.
- 32% offer competency-based courses only.
- 14% offer at least one full CBE certificate or degree program.
- 3% say CBE is the predominant mode at their institution.

Institutions with programs offer a total of 512 certificate and degree programs:

- 427 Undergraduate programs
- 85 Graduate programs

Nursing and computer sciences were the most commonly reported CBE program disciplines.

Which students are being served by CBE programs?

- 50% reported students of color
- 75% reported adults age 25 or older
- 50% reported students with prior credits

...make up at least half of their student population.

In the last academic year...

- 44% had fewer than 50 students enrolled
- 16% had more than 1000 students enrolled
QUALITY ASSURANCE ESSENTIAL
Anchored in Quality

- Began with *Shared Design Elements and Emerging Practices*
- Created a Quality Standards Task Force
- Multiple convenings with hundreds of individuals offering feedback
- Anticipate refinement as evidence base grows
# Eight Elements of Quality

1. Demonstrated Institutional Commitment to and Capacity for CBE Innovation
2. Clear, Measurable, Meaningful and Integrated Competencies
3. Coherent Program and Curriculum Design
4. Credential-level Assessment Strategy with Robust Implementation
5. Intentionally Designed and Engaged Learner Experience
6. Collaborative Engagement with External Partners
7. Transparency of Student Learning
8. Evidence-driven Continuous Improvement
Resources

October 22-25, 2019
Palm Springs, CA
www.cbexchange.org
Why the renewed interest?
Renewed Interest

• Attainment goals – 60x25
• Breaking the iron triangle of cost, quality, and access
• Employer feedback
• Validating learning wherever it occurs [e.g., military training]
• New technology solutions
• Portable, personalized records of learning
• Federal landscape
Common Misperceptions About CBE

• You can just rename standards and call them competencies. [Competencies are distinguished from standards in that they are intentionally designed with assessment in mind.]

• CBE programs can give credit for prior experience. [Title IV rules do not allow funds to be used for prior experience. Designated direct assessment sites have particular flexibility.]

• All prior learning should/will be granted college credit. [Not all prior learning equates to collegiate-level work.]

• CBE programs are quicker and less expensive. [Not necessarily – sometimes learning takes more time.]

• CBE only applies to technical training. [It is used in a wide array of disciplines and fields including the liberal arts, medicine, allied health, ministerial preparation, etc.]
Ohio’s Attainment Goal

65% of Ohioans between the ages of 25 and 64 will have a degree, certificate or other postsecondary credential of value in the workplace by the year 2025
If We Hope to Meet the Goal, It Cannot Be “Business as Usual”

- Educate more adults
- Align credentials to in-demand jobs
Report on the Condition of Higher Education

• What is competency-based education and why is it valuable?

• Are Ohio’s colleges and universities engaging in or planning to engage in competency-based education?

• What are best practices for implementing competency-based education programs?

• What are the next steps for Ohio?
Survey

• Defined CBE for the survey
• Defined phases of CBE development
• Sent to all public colleges and universities
• ODHE staff performed an initial analysis and followed up with all institutions
Are you currently engaged in any phase of CBE?

Number of Colleges and Universities Engaged in CBE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Academic Program Areas

Discipline Area Planned for CBE Program

- Business: 0
- Engineering: 8
- Health: 3
- Social Sciences: 1
- Trades & Technicians: 1
- Arts & Humanities: 0
- Education: 0
- Law: 0
- Science and Math: 0
- Services: 0
Types of Programs

Level for CBE Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate's Degree</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master's Degree</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ohio Department of Higher Education
What can ODHE do to assist?

How Could ODHE Help with the CBE Process

- Share best practices: 35
- Establish clear policies: 23
- Provide speakers/meetings/webinars: 18
- Provide general information: 16
- Other - please specify: 8
Resources on Best Practices

• Competency-Based Education Network (CBEN)
  – CBE Design Planner
  – Quality Framework for CBE Programs (draft at time of report)
  – Quality Framework Users Guide (new since time of report)
  – “Story Telling” Guide (new since time of report)

• Education Advisory Board (EAB)
  – CBE Readiness Diagnostic
  – Program Selection Guide
  – Program Development Roadmap
  – Model CBE Business Case
Recommendation: Create an Ohio Network

- Steering Committee Meetings
  - share campus information
  - small work teams

- Steering Committee Workshops
  - EAB
  - CBEN
  - Sinclair FlexPace program
  - Financial Aid and HLC Accreditation
  - CBE for Administrators/CBE for Faculty members

- Website: https://ohiocbenetwork.org/
Growth in CBE Programs Across Ohio

• Sinclair College now has 12 CBE programs
  – IT (associates and certificate programs)
  – Business (associates certificate programs)
  – Criminal Justice (certificate)
  – Unmanned Aerial Systems (certificate)
  – Advanced Manufacturing (certificate)

• Student Outcomes
  – 2000 students enrolled to date; 1200 certificates and degrees earned
  – Students, on average, finish 30% more quickly
  – Students complete programs at rates 10-15% higher than traditional counterparts
  – 70% are adult learners; 70% either new to Sinclair or back after a “stop-out”
Growth in CBE Programs Across Ohio

• Lorain County Community College offers 6 programs where students can complete 50-70% of the coursework in the CBE modality
  – AAS in computer and digital forensics
  – Certificate in computer and digital forensics
  – AAS in computer applications integration specialist
  – Certificate in computer and digital forensics
  – AAS in computer maintenance and networking
  – Certificate in computer maintenance and networking

• 17 students have taken coursework using this modality, with 15 of them being successful

• LCCC’s “Validate IT” program creates an individualized pathway for individuals with existing IT certifications who want to show currency or earn a degree
Growth in CBE Programs Across Ohio

• BGSU is currently working on two programs
  – Quality Systems
  – Alternate Resident Educator program (graduate certificate)

• University of Cincinnati
  – Graduate Certificate in Information Technology
  – 18 graduate credit hours offered as 18 competencies
  – 7 enrolled in year 1; 11 in year 2; 18 teachers in year 3
Growth in CBE Programs Across Ohio

• Edison State Community College
  – Faculty working this summer on certificate programs in IT and Manufacturing

• University of Toledo
  – Early in the process contracted with Blackboard to provide consultation with UT’s instructional designers
  – Piloted courses during this past academic year
  – Plan to launch RN-BSN completion program this fall

• Columbus State Community College
  – Launched Non Credit Certificate Programs in Cyber Security, Data Analytics and Software Development
What is ODHE’s role; Where Do We Go From Here?

• Facilitate campus activity
  – Provide information, such as the baseline data reported in the conditions report
  – Support the work of the steering committee by providing administrative support and convening space
  – Small financial contributions for group professional development activities
  – Provide “permission” for campuses to think and innovate

• Let the work of the steering committee continue!!!

• Other recommendations from the Conditions Report
  – Review state laws and policies
  – Identify standard data to be collected to help inform future recommendations
Role of the SHEEO: Illinois Board of Higher Education

- Develop model for competency-based system of preparation, credentialing, and professional development
- Provide technical assistance
- Link workforce development, state agencies, institutions of higher education, advocacy groups, and private philanthropy
- Explain and leverage policies to support innovation
Collaborative Partners

• Illinois Board of Higher Education
• Illinois Network of Child Care Resource and Referral Agencies
• 74 institutions of higher education entitled to offer Illinois Gateways credentials
  – Public universities
  – Public community colleges
  – Private colleges and universities
• Multiple state agencies, including the Governor’s Office of Early Childhood Development and Illinois Community College Board
• Advocacy groups
• Private philanthropy
Early Childhood Educators (ECE) in Illinois

- **112,579** practitioners in the Gateways Registry (not inclusive of licensed K-12 educators)
- Working in **3,105** licensed centers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Licensed Center Administrator (N=5677)</th>
<th>Licensed Center Teacher (N=22,382)</th>
<th>Licensed Center Assistant Teacher (N=15,569)</th>
<th>Licensed Family Child Care Owner / Provider (N=7387)</th>
<th>Licensed Family Child Care Assistant (N=3890)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>62.4%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td>49.4%</td>
<td>42.0%</td>
<td>33.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>23.0%</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
<td>37.7%</td>
<td>33.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latino</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>21.2%</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-Racial</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Today’s ECE Workforce Challenges

- Low-status, low-pay profession
- 46% of early childhood workers qualify for public benefits
- Yet, 70% hold associate, bachelor or graduate degrees in some field of study
- Variation in employment entry and licensing requirements
- Educator shortages
- Need for number of ECE teachers to grow 15 percent in 6 years

Source: Illinois Network of Child Care Resource and Referral Agencies
700 New Neural Connections Every Second

Improves children’s school readiness
Helps high-need, vulnerable children transition to elementary school
Brings 13% return on investment in early childhood education
Cuts crime, public dependency
Increases education level, employment, earnings over lifetime

Sources: Barnett (2011); Barnett & Masse (2007); Camilli, Vargas, Ryan, & Barnett (2010); Diamond & Lee (2011); Heckman (2016)
Competency-Based System Offers Solutions for ECE Workforce

• Transparent, sustainable system
• More chances to advance
• Reflects best practices in workforce development
• Aligns qualifications, credentialing across profession and state
• Clearly maps routes to for career progression
• Supports diversity in early childhood education workforce
Gateways to Opportunity® Early Childhood Educator Career Lattice

ECE: Foundational Early Childhood Educator requirements for all Credentials
FCC: Family Child Care Credential
ITC: Infant Toddler Credential
IDC: Illinois Director Credential
TA: Technical Assistance Credential

The ECE Credential is the foundation for three Gateways Credentials.

For more details on each Credential, visit www.iGateways.com
# Gateways to Opportunity® Early Childhood Educator (ECE) Credential Framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL</th>
<th>EDUCATION REQUIREMENTS</th>
<th>COLLEGE EDUCATION &amp; TRAINING REQUIRED COMPETENCIES IN EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION</th>
<th>WORK &amp; PRACTICAL EXPERIENCE IN EARLY CARE &amp; EDUCATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LEVEL 6</td>
<td>Graduate Degree</td>
<td>Must meet ECE Credential Level 5 requirements plus:</td>
<td>6,000 hours of documented ECE-related experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mastery in at least 3 of the 7 ECE Level 6 Skill Areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Six professional contributions demonstrating competency in three different areas within the last five years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEVEL 5</td>
<td>Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>Must meet all previous level competencies plus:</td>
<td>Minimum of 200 hours of ECE supervised experience or 1,200 total hours of documented ECE work experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Human Growth and Development (HGD5, HGD6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Health, Safety, and Well-Being (HSW7, HSW8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Observation and Assessment (OA7, OMA)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Curriculum or Program Design (CPD10)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Interactions, Relationships, and Environments (IER6, IRE7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Family and Community Relationships (FCR7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Personal and Professional Development (PPD7, PPD8, PPD9, PPD10)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEVEL 4</td>
<td>Associate's Degree or 60+ semester hours (including the 9 semester hours listed at level 3)</td>
<td>Must meet all previous level competencies plus:</td>
<td>100 total hours of ECE supervised experience or 600 total hours of documented ECE work experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Human Growth and Development (HGD4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Health, Safety and Well-Being (HSW6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Observation and Assessment (OAM4, OAM5, OAM6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Curriculum or Program Design (CPD4, CPD5, CPD6, CPD7, CPD8, CPD9)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Interactions, Relationships, and Environments (IER5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Personal and Professional Development (PPD5, PPD6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEVEL 3</td>
<td>Three semester hours in each: Any Math, English, and General Education electives (Psychology, Sociology, Science, etc.) (These 9 hours must be credit bearing and nondevelopmental 100 level +)</td>
<td>Must meet all previous level competencies plus:</td>
<td>10 hours of ECE supervised experience or 400 total hours of documented ECE work experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Human Growth and Development (HGD3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Health, Safety, and Well-Being (HSW3, HSW4, HSW5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Observation and Assessment (OAM1, OAM2, OAM3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Curriculum or Program Design (CPD1, CPD2, CPD3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Interactions, Relationships, and Environments (IER3, IRE4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Family and Community Relationships (FCR3, FCR4, FCR5, FCR6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Personal and Professional Development (PPD3, PPD4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEVEL 2</td>
<td>High School Diploma or GED</td>
<td>ECE Human Growth and Development (HGD1, HGD2, HGD3)</td>
<td>10 hours of ECE observation or 200 hours of documented ECE work experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Health, Safety, and Well-Being (HSW1, HSW2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Interactions, Relationships, and Environments (IER1, IRE2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Family and Community Relationships (FCR1, FCR2, FCR3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ECE Personal and Professional Development (PPD1, PPD2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Level 1 ECE Credential is awarded through completion of a 48 clock hour training available through local Child Care Resource & Referral Agencies statewide or 16 modules online and meets these ECE competencies HGD1, HSW1, IRE1, IRE2, and FCR1.

The Child Development Associate Preschool (CDA) meets these ECE competencies: MSW1, HSW2, IRE1, IRE2, FCR1 and PPD1.

In addition to meeting required competencies through college coursework, up to 10 competencies (total) may be documented through credential approved training for Levels 2-4 and up to 15 competencies (total) may be documented through credential approved training for Levels 5 and 6.
Competency Toolbox

www.ilgateways.com/professional-development/higher-education-programs/ece-toolbox
Questions?

- **Stephanie Bernoteit**
  bernoteit@ibhe.org

- **Stephanie Davidson**
  SDavidson@highered.ohio.gov

- **Charla Long**
  charla@c-ben.org